Doctoral School of Law and Political Sciences of the Pázmány Péter Catholic University

Judicial enforcement and proportional solidarity: legal and social ethical concerns

Doctoral thesis

Eszter dr. Sőréné dr. Batka

Supervisor:

Dr. Nándor Máté Birher, PhD

Dean of Pázmány Péter Catholic University Faculty of Humanities

Budapest

2023.

Introduction

The court bailiff (or enforcement agent) has never been and will probably never be a popular figure in Hungary, and presumably this is the case outside the country as well. People in difficult living conditions could have always been afraid of him, both in the past and now, so much so that he actually became a negative literary hero. The bohemians and artists used to make fun of him, like Frigyes Karinthy (famous Hungarian author in the 20th century), the "laughing wise man" as his fellow writers called him. For example, it was recorded that he was playing billiards at his regular haunt, the Hadik coffee house, when one of the bailiffs who regularly visited him suddenly appeared to carry out the seizure after he was not found at home. Karinthy, when he saw him sighed, "Sit down, my dear friend, I see, son, you will retire from me ..."

Emil Ábrányi also wrote a one-act comedy titled "The Bailiff", which premiered on February 15, 1886, ² probably not coincidentally a few years after the Parliament adopted Act LX of 1881, the legal article on judicial enforcement. In the play, however, it is the executor who saves the poor widow from the evil creditor, who demands her adopted daughter as his wife in exchange for the termination of the enforcement procedure. Although it is also true that this is the last case of that bailiff, since at the same time he gives up his profession.³

The bailiff also appears in several Hungarian folk songs. For example: "The judge comes to execute, / then the bailiff /, takes away our bed /, our last bushel of wheat."⁴

In the Roman era, enforcement involving the body of an insolvent debtor undoubtedly shows the rigor of the ancient laws and the debtor's weaker position,⁵ but even then there were laws that protected the debtor against the creditor, considering that maintaining a certain balance is essential.

¹Szoták Attila: Karinthy és a végrehajtó,

https://tozsdemamor.blog.hu/2011/10/11/karinthy_es_a_vegrehajto?layout=5 date of access:2022. 05. 23. ²https://mandadb.hu/dokumentum/583734/brnyi_Emil_A_vgrehajt_16332.pdf date of access: 2022. 05. 23.

³ Dr. Trócsányi László beszéde, https://www.parlament.hu/naplo40/085/n085_0002.htm. date of access: 2022. 05.

⁴https://www.zeneszoveg.hu/dalszoveg/117905/nepdal/igyuk-a-bort-jo-vastagon-zeneszoveg.html. date of access: 2022. 04. 20.

⁵Jakab Éva: Gondolatok Pólay Elemér korai tanulmányaihoz: a nemzeti szocializmus és a római jog. Juridpol Fórum, 143.o. http://acta.bibl.u-szeged.hu/70790/1/juridpol_forum_010_002_125-145.pdf, (2022. május 25.)

The legal notion of "a giving in payment" (datio in solutum)⁶ was already present in ancient Rome with the mutual will of the parties very early on - i.e. the parties had the option to change the object of the obligation if the debtor could not offer the originally stipulated service for performance⁷ (in solutum dare és accipere, pro debito accipere).

As it can be clearly seen from the examples listed above, bailiffs could be called the "black sheep" of law. ⁸ But no matter how impopular they are and always have been, we need them, since the only possible "alternative would be reprivatization of this function, money collection, self-judgment." The task of both the legislator and the law enforcer is therefore to make enforcement as humane as possible, but at the same time, seemingly contradictory, to make it the most effective and the most compliant with the requirements of the rule of law. Just as criminal imprisonment and restrictions of freedom cannot be avoided in order to protect society, the individual and the state; as jurisdiction is not a humanitarian issue, but the success of the penal system depends on it; so the enforcement procedure cannot do without certain types of sanctions, in order to force the law-abiding behavior. ¹⁰

Should it be inevitable that this negative trend will continue in the future regarding the judgment of the bailiff and his procedure, or is there a possibility to "whitewash" the profession?

Purpose of the thesis, significance of the topic

My choice of topic primarily stems from my work because I work in the field of judicial enforcement. Many negative personal experiences inspired the topic, which was the basis for outlining a possible system that would be unique in Hungary and perhaps in the world. According to the general opinion, the bailiff is the necessary bad, the cause of "all troubles", as the person seeking enforcement gets his legitimate claim too late, and through a costly and lengthy procedure, while the debtor is forced to fulfill his debt too early against his will, as a result of a claim and procedure, which he considers unfounded and unlawful. Nowadays, there are several reports in the media about corruption, which have also included the community of enforcement agents, as a result of which, unfortunately, people generalize and stigmatize. I

⁶ Pólay Elemér: Datio in solutum. Miskolc, 1938. 51. p.

⁷ Pólay Elemér: A kamat a római jogban. Miskolc, 1943., 112. o.

⁸https://nepszava.hu/1014425_a-jog-fekete-baranya date of access: 2021. 04. 17.

⁹https://www.parlament.hu/naplo40/085/n085_0002.htm date of access: 2022. 05. 23.

¹⁰Vókó György: Magyar büntetés – végrehajtási jog, Dialóg Campus Kiadó, Budapest – Pécs, 2009., p. 13.

believe that something needs to be done on the basis of which people's faith in justice may be strengthened again and they can realize that unjustified and disproportionate benefits, as well as prolonged enforcement procedures cannot be in the interest of either debtors or legislators. In my thesis, I focus on solutions, compromises, and proportionality, considering that respecting proportionality is the primary aspect that the legislator must take into account. 11 I make proposals to lay the foundations of a system that can serve the interests of both debtors and claimants. However, it is not the aim of the thesis to present the entire course of the enforcement procedure, and to develop the possible system outlined in the thesis in a comprehensive manner. The thesis places particular emphasis on helping debtors who have been evicted and are in a hopeless situation. The research tries to find feasible, complex solutions to possible housing problems after evictions. In the part of the thesis containing a historical overview, I focused exclusively on how and when eviction appeared as a concept and its practical implementation in the governing legislation, without the need to present the enforcement procedure in its entirety. I consider the establishment of proper communication between people to be the central point of the thesis, which is an essential condition for conscious thinking. At the same time, I am convinced that it is necessary to reconsider, possibly expand and correct certain parts of the implementation. I believe that, taking into account the current legal situation and the general opinion about the enforcement procedures, we are currently not in accordance with the general purpose of the enforcement procedures, and, as a result of the judgment based on a wrong basis, the respect and appreciation of the professional work may have been pushed into the background. All this does not facilitate the development of law-abiding behavior and the strengthening of trust in the justice system. In order to conduct a fair, yet smooth and efficient procedure, I consider proportionality to be particularly important, which should play a key role in every procedure.

Thesis statements:

The purpose of the research has been defined according to the following statements

1. Today bailiffs have an increasingly poor reputation, in many cases it is due to negative media representation.

_

¹¹Xenophon Condiates - Alkeme Fotiadou: Szociális jogok az arányosság korában: A globális gazdasági válság és az alkotmányos jogviták, Oxford University Press, New York University School of Law, 2012., p. 671.

- 2. Lack of communication and appropriate, targeted information, as well as misinformation resulting from creating a negative attitude, leads to resistance. The procedures are getting longer, the number of debtors, especially from the younger age group (20-30, 30-40 years), is increasing year by year. Procedures are postponed unilaterally, and the debtors are perceived more favorably by the public. A significant part of the society including opinion leaders also regards the bailiffs as the persons "causing their situation", and confuses the society's expectation of efficiency and effectiveness with profit orientation.
- 3. Judicial enforcement cannot be viewed as a one-sided process, the system works with adequate efficiency if the interests of all persons involved in the procedure are respected and individual interests are kept in balance.
- 4. At the same time, providing adequate information and helping the disadvantaged by society impose essential duties for the enforcement agents. They have to show expertise, behave lawfully and beempathetic, but at the same time they must stick to the law, be efficient and effective. In addition to the fact that the lack of legal compliance is obviously the cause of the enforcement procedure, in most cases it causes resistance, and state coercion must necessarily prevail. In addition to the necessary obligations, I consider it fundamentally important that, similarly to the Scandinavian model, people receive social aids on the basis of need. People should be encouraged to show lawabiding behavior, and one of the tools for this is court enforcement: they should not to wait for the aid, but rather find a job for themselves. They must be made aware that the system works well when members of society actively contribute to it.

Discussion of the thesis statements:

The main objective related to the topic is to connect the judicial enforcement procedure with the existing social network (a system based on solidarity) in Hungary, given that, as I have already mentioned, no particular attention has been paid to this initiative so far, and the topic hardly has a literary background. The involvement of the social network in the enforcement procedure has not been successful, although it would be extremely important for debtors in trouble when they are on the verge of eviction.

In my research, I examine the connection between solidarity and judicial enforcement from different perspectives. I propose the creation of a possible new system that would connect the

enforcement procedures to a more reasonable and presumably more efficient social system. The purpose of creating the system would be to help debtors directly affected by the procedure and who are demonstrably in a difficult situation as a result of that, and this would obviously have an impact on claimants as well. It could help the procedures to be carried out, and as a result, it might act as an incentive for debtors as well. In common parlance, solidarity means mutual commitment and the willingness to help each other. In my opinion, the emphasis is on reciprocity, i.e. the aim would be to build a consensus of solidarity in which, similarly to social security, the burden is shared on the basis of performance. I consider solidarity to be of fundamental importance in the procedures, however, it must be kept in mind that not only the interests of the debtors, but also the interests of those asking for enforcement must be taken into account. From my point of view, debtors are getting the attention they need in the media and through various organisations and state measures which help them, while much less notice is taken of claimants. It seems as if debtors deserve absolute protection, while we tend to condemn those who have claims. Presumably this can be due to the unpleasant feeling that many of us have already experienced in our lives, when the guilt is not of the person who owes, but of the person who rightfully wants to get it back.

In my view, it is not fair to place the interests of one party ahead of the interests of the other, i.e. to take measures that benefit only one of them. Just as proportionality and gradualness are fundamental principles in implementing debt collection procedures, solidarity must be achieved proportionately, as well. In the words of Gábor Iványi, Methodist minister: "If you don't give the other one what you'd expect in a similar situation, maybe one day you'll have no hope of solidarity."¹²

Keeping the principle of proportionality in mind, I suggest the development of a system that would make court collections more efficient and faster. It is important to note that conducting a procedure within a shorter period of time would also be in the interest of the debtors in the long term, since the increase in interest rates can be mitigated by this. The proposal includes, among other things, the implementation of an online system that would require the uploading of contracts concluded for a certain fee (comprising the agreements between lawyers, notaries and private individuals). Consequently, in order to understand the necessity of this system, it is

¹² Iványi Gábor: Hajléktalanok, Sík Kiadó Kft., Budapest, 1997.

essential to know the categories of criminal law related to their enforcement procedures. The operating costs of the system could be covered by the registration fees, so the withdrawal of funds that happens in many cases during the procedures would become controllable. All of this is in the interest of the state, as well as the actors of the state, since the effort to make the economy transparent is always essential. Concepts from the criminal law-related aspects of judicial enforcement therefore lead us to understand the need for the "Collection of Contracts". Obviously, the development of the basis of the system and the "Collection of Contracts" is hypothetical, their detailed elaboration would be a much more complex task, which may be the subject of a further study in the near future. It should be noted here that my research was greatly hindered by the fact that I was not able to consult with all of the bodies I wanted to contact. My next goal is to arouse interest and spread the concept as widely as possible. However, it is of fundamental importance to get familiar with the process itself, which inspired their creation, and to understand it through practical examples, which sometimes seem a bit personal, but are necessary for understanding. I would like to emphasize again that the system outlined in the thesis can be a schematic framework for a complex system developed in the future, or at least it can be considered as its starting point. Of course, coordination with the relevant bodies remains an essential condition for the implementation.

In my research, I also want to highlight which age group is most often involved in the procedures. I compare the distribution of the cases of two different bailiff's offices, broken down by year and taking age groups into account. One office is from Eastern Hungary, the other from Western Hungary, and I have been actively involved in the work of both offices participating in the research for years. Originally, the main purpose of the investigation was to present a statistical analysis about Vas County (West) and Békés County (East), however, some of the offices could not adequately assess the purpose of the scientific research and the significance of the possible results, and therefore they provided only partial data or no data at all. Therefore I only used the data of the offices in which I worked. With a larger amount of data, a more detailed report could probably have been created. However, it is still evident from the statistical data that as the years progress, the proportion of young age groups increases rapidly in the cases received by both offices. Taking this trend into account, we can conclude that the flow of information is inadequate on the part of the media, the Government, and the executive society. Financial education, especially if we look back at the last two decades, has become an increasingly important tool worldwide in order to complete financial inclusion, increase consumer welfare, and strengthen the stability of financial systems. The most

significant development in this area can be observed after the 2007-2008 financial crisis.¹³ Nowadays, many governments and social organizations are seriously concerned with the development of financial education and the management of payment difficulties, which is necessary, but not sufficient in my opinion. Within the framework of appropriate financial education, particular emphasis should be placed on the enforcement procedure, especially its consequences. All of this would be important because if the people against whom enforcement was initiated do not have adequate knowledge, it is difficult for them to assess the consequences, they have no insight into them. In many cases, they are anxious because of the problems that have arisen, they experience all this as a shame in front of their neighbors, the fear of the consequences usually puts them in a state of paralyzing stress, which can further aggravate their already difficult situation.

The need for social security has appeared many times throughout history. It is present in the services provided within the social security system, in the creation of labor market policies, social assistance, the social care system organized on a micro-level and regional basis, child protection and family support programs. However, this sense of relative security is lost when a debtor loses his only residential property during an enforcement procedure, despite the fact that the state provides him with conditions that can be regarded as absolute security, or as a kind of guaranteed minimum. In my thesis, special emphasis is placed on the Church, which nowadays assumes an increasingly important role in education and in helping the disadvantaged. One of my goals is to strengthen the role of the Church and charitable organizations, which, together with local governments, would be able to establish appropriate communication, provide more information, and provide spiritual assistance. In addition, by using the amount flowing into the social fund, also to provide housing for the needy.

Structure of the thesis, applied methods

_

¹³Terták Elemér: Pénzügyi oktatás a világban, In: Gazdaság és pénzügy 9. évf. 1. sz., 2022. p. 2.

Considering that the thesis consists of several units, the methods used are also adapted to the structure of the units, i.e. they change depending on the structural units, or they may be combined.

During the investigation carried out within the framework of the research, I will describe judicial enforcement in general, and then the development of judicial enforcement from ancient times to the present day, using a dogmatic analytical and comparative method.

In the second chapter, special emphasis is placed on the possession process, the appearance of the eviction phase, through the development of the legal background. The examination follows a chronological line.

In the third chapter I discuss the introduction of the electronic auction system by analyzing the related literature, and describe its history, I clarify the basic conceptual issues typical of auctions, such as the concept of sale in occupied and move-in condition. I deal with the transfer of real estate, the domestic regulation of evictions, as well as its shortcomings, and propose possible solutions for them, based on practical experience.

The fourth chapter is an international outlook. Using a dogmatic-descriptive analysis, I compare the practice of Austria and Germany with the Hungarian procedures, with particular emphasis on the differences in procedures and enforcement systems in relation to evictions and the social background. Relying largely on Internet references, I study the legal provisions specific to the given country. This chapter includes a comparison of the German and Austrian regulations with the Hungarian system, both in terms of the legal background and personnel conditions. The description outlines the similarities between the German and Austrian systems, which differ from the Hungarian regulation in certain aspects. In this chapter, too, I focused primarily on the investigation of auctions and evictions, as well as the relationship between the court and the bailiffs. The essence of the analysis is the fact that the different regulations do not give us the opportunity to incorporate certain stages into the domestic system, but at the same time there are preventive elements of an Austrian or German eviction, the adoption of which could be considered in order to conduct the procedures more smoothly and empathetically.

In the fifth chapter, I examine the concept of solidarity, its types, its importance, and why solidarity is necessary during an enforcement procedure. I study the relationship between sociology and

enforcement, social norms, the formation and meaning of ethics, morality, moral norm as concepts and their development as a result of social changes. I elaborate on the development of the concept and system of solidarity, its existence in society. Among other things, I discover how written and unwritten ethical rules and moral norms were formed, what role they have or could have, and how the established rules and norms should be embedded in people's behavior. The chapter mainly defines concepts, based on different perspectives, so I primarily use a descriptive method. The descriptive method is complemented by a dogmatic analysis, since I am looking for the answer to whether social cooperation can exist, whether moral behavior can be learned and taught, and where and how all of this can appear in the field of enforcement procedures.

In the sixth chapter, I describe the four European social models in terms of the role of the state. Since I mainly define concepts, based on different points of view, I primarily use a purely descriptive method. It is important that in a certain part of the thesis I discuss the social system of other states, mainly concentrating on the Scandinavian states with developed social systems. In my opinion, certain things could be adapted from their system, also for the further development of the Hungarian system.

In the seventh chapter, I examine the relationship between solidarity and enforcement. I will present the measures that regulated the enforcement procedures providing various benefits to the debtors, thus hindering the procedures. The critical analysis appears as a new element with the concept of "proportional solidarity" in mind, which approach is maintained throughout the writing of the thesis. Making sure that the balance is kept, I present proposals for both parties, with the aim of making law-abiding behavior even more coercive. In relation to debtors and enforcement applicants, the chapter separately presents the enforcement measures that can be used to make the procedure run more smoothly.

The eighth and ninth chapters, using the quantitative statistical methods experienced during tabular analyses, point out that young people are involved in the enforcement procedures in increasing numbers. The mathematical-statistical method is essential to demonstrate this. I prepared the data used for the research with the help of the unified administration system (EVÜR) used during court enforcement, which system is excellent for generating graphs from the retrieved data for the research. From the data in the graphs, for the period between 1997 and 2022, it is possible to track which age group is involved in debt in an annual breakdown. It can also be noted that year by year this ratio shifts more and more towards the younger age group,

which I think may stem from a fundamental lack of communication. From the analysis of a large number of data, I can prove my outlined theoretical statements deductively. According to the literature, the results of quantitative research supported by numerical data are suitable for testing research hypotheses in many areas. Although they often only record the information that appears on the surface and do not provide an opportunity for a deeper understanding of problems, processes, and human behavior, ¹⁴ I still believe that a conclusion can be drawn by comparing the results obtained with more than ten years of experience and quantitative data. It should also be noted that I have the opportunity to investigate this in the eastern and western regions of the country (Vas county and Békés county districts). The results obtained during the analysis of the data can also create a basis for comparison in relation to the two regions of the country.

The tenth chapter builds on the results of the previous chapter. Basically, it aims to connect the enforcement network with the social system, thereby creating an opportunity to develop a social system based on solidarity. The chapter introduces the forums one by one, whose active participation, by reforming already established systems, would make it possible to build the connection. Here it is necessary to emphasize that these systems already exist, the social base could be created by reforming them with minor changes and reallocation of certain financial resources. I also propose the introduction of a possible new system, the basic purpose of which would be to make the economy more transparent. Last but not least, it could provide additional financial assistance to the social fund. The primary goal of creating a social fund would be to help the social classes that my concept targets, since in their case mere "spiritual" assistance is by no means sufficient, since they are struggling with such a deep social problem that can no longer be solved with counseling. At the same time, one should not underestimate the support of local governments, churches, and charitable organizations, which are also intended to be used as part of the concept. In my opinion, a permanent source of income is an essential condition for proper and safe operation of the system.

Summary of research results, suggestions

The basic objective of my thesis was to link the enforcement procedures to a social system, and to create the possibility that debtors in a difficult situation would be given some chance to start over and receive some form of support. The aim of the concept outlined in the thesis is to

-

¹⁴Boncz Imre: Kutatásmódszertani alapismeretek, Pécsi Tudományegyetem Egészségtudományi Kar, Pécs, 2015. p. 25.

implement a network that has a permanent source of income, thus offering a financial instrument for providing assistance.

In the course of developing the topic, I basically tried to examine the enforcement procedure as a coercive measure from as many aspects as possible, since we tend to judge the enforcement only from the perspective of the debtor, thus putting the position of the enforcement agents in procedural law in a different light.

The thesis is based on proportionality, which I consider to be of fundamental importance in the conduct of proceedings, since both the debtor and the person requesting enforcement may have rights, but they tend to forget their obligations sometimes. Just as we need to be aware of our rights, we must also be aware of our obligations in order to behave in accordance with the law.

In relation to evictions throughout history, it can be said that the directions and legal regulations regarding evictions provide debtors with more and more favorable opportunities, and in some cases the balance even shifts towards the debtors. In order to conduct the appropriate procedures, I consider it necessary to correct the legislation, or at least to introduce differentiation with regard to the title of the claims. The measure for the sale of the seized immovable property, as well as the regulation related to the capital debt of five hundred thousand forints, can seriously harm the interests of the claimant, but the endless procedure is not beneficial for the debtor either. The Vht. (Hungarian abbreviation for the Act on Judicial Enforcement) does not contain regulations on what kind of procedure must be conducted in such cases, or how long the procedures must be maintained. I believe that legislative intervention is inevitable, otherwise the interest may increase many times the capital claim and the current regulation does not provide a substantial solution for either the debtor or the person requesting enforcement. Based on my point of view, the situation described above can be supported by the example that the current regulation exempts all real estate from auctioning in procedures under a capital claim of HUF 500,000. Consequently, there is no differentiation even with regard to residential and non-residential real estate, so this example obviously proves the fact that claims can be enforced through the courts, but at the same time, there is a legal obstacle to the implementation of final decisions, despite the existence of a legally enforceable document, which in my opinion is not in accordance with the Fundamental Law of Hungary. In some cases, even though the debtors want to get rid of their debt, they still cannot, because they

are not entitled to initiate the auction of their own real estate, so an appropriate amendment of the law may also be necessary in this regard.

Communication, targeted and appropriate information is a fundamental and mandatory task for the bailiff's office. At the same time, based on our experience, that trust has been shaken, which is a consequence of the public's negative judgment and generalizations of the enforcement agents. Public trust must be restored, the cornerstone of which could be the initiative from the bailiffs, which I intend to implement with my concept, with the involvement of many other bodies.

Professional, lawful, empathetic enforcement, can be read on the website of the SZTFH (Supervisory Authority for Regulatory Affairs, a new supervisory body in Hungary), which the bailiff must implement during the procedure. Empathy is when a person imagines himself in another person's situation. Taking into account the fact that during an enforcement procedure, the bailiff is bound by several deadlines, it is difficult to comply with the three requirements set by the SZTFH. The bailiff must behave empathetically during the procedure, which makes it difficult to conduct a legally correct and professional procedure, since it is still an enforcement procedure, which is subject to strict procedural deadlines. At the same time, empathy on the part of the executors could be realized in the field of assistance, which could also be carried out through the development of the social care system and the creation of the social basis.

However, people must accept that help is not provided on a universal basis: similarly to the Scandinavian social system, the individual's active contribution is also necessary. In addition to the distribution of social benefits on the basis of need, I believe that a positive attitude is also necessary, which, apart from a few cases, is hardly present in the procedures. Development and adaptation are essential.

The eighth chapter of the thesis deals separately with the age distribution of debtors by office, broken down by years. The trend clearly shows that younger age groups are increasingly involved in the procedures, which age groups were barely represented as debtors a decade ago. Raising awareness and financial education are therefore necessary, but we cannot forget about the long-term consequences of improper money management.

Adequate communication and familiarization with the process of the enforcement procedure should take place even before the procedure starts, but at least in the early stages of the process, so that unpleasant consequences can be avoided. It is a disappointing experience that local governments do not have sufficient resources to provide adequate assistance when we contact them to carry out an eviction. With the actual implementation of the concept, which only exists in theory for the time being, not only the financial background would be available, but also an entire social network can be put together (the units of which are already present separately, but the connection between them is missing) so that people in need can have a chance to start a new life.

List of publications:

Studia Wesprimiensia 2019. december: A kilakoltatás etikai, szociológiai megközelítésben

XVIII. Jogász Doktoranduszok Országos Szakmai Találkozója kötet 2020.: Az árverést követő birtokba adás kérésének időpontjához fűződő jogértelmezési kérdések

Az életminőség-fejlesztés új paradigmái a 21. században című kötet. 2020. Az erkölcs a jog és a vallás kapcsolata. Tanítható-e az erkölcsös magatartás?

Executio – Magyar Bírósági Végrehajtói Kar hivatalos szakmai lapja 2019. VIII. évfolyam 3. száma. A lakottan, illetve a beköltözhetően történő ingatlanok értékesítésének anomáliái

Cambridge Open Engage, 2020., Human Solidarity – The ultimate victory of good-will, understanding, knowledge and peace.

Humán Innovációs szemle 2020/1. Szolidaritás és végrehajtás

Cambridge Open Engage, 2020., What the world needs now is solidarity

Cambridge Open Engage, 2020., Control Complexity: Relationship instead of competitiveness.

Karoli Mundus, 2021. Human solidarity – the ultimate victory of good-will, understanding, knowledge and peace

Glossa Juridica különszám, 2021. A Covid-19 és az orvosi etikai elvek összeegyeztethetősége a különleges jogrend tükrében.

Studia Wesprimiensia különszám 2021. Végrehajtás, kilakoltatás. Lehet másképp?

Hátrányos helyzetek, devianciák és a társas segítés: a Veszprémi Érseki Hittudományi Főiskola megbízásából című tanulmánykötet, 2021., Létezhet-e társadalmi együttműködés? Meddig terjed a szolidaritás pozitív hatása?

XIX. Jogász Doktoranduszok Országos Szakmai Találkozója kötet, 2021., Végrehajtás és kilakoltatás: Magyarország, Ausztria és Németország vonatkozásában.

XX. Jogász Doktoranduszok Országos Szakmai Találkozója kötet, 2021., Etikus végrehajtás

KRE-DÖK Multidiszciplináris konferencia, 2021., A bírósági végrehajtás törvényes lefolyását célzó büntetőjogi eszközök. A bírósági végrehajtás akadályozása, mint büntetőjogi kategória.

Humán Innovációs szemle, 2021. XII. évf. 2021/1. szám., Végrehajtás és szolidaritás a végrehajtást kérő szemszögéből, az arányosság elve.

Vallás és biztonság kutatóműhely, "Szeretetből szolgálni" című kiadvány, 2021., Regulation of judicial enforcement while enforcing social aspects.

Cambridge Engage, 2022. Judicial enforcement by social aspects

Humán Innovációs Szemle, XII. évfolyam 2. szám december, 2021 A bírósági végrehajtás és a büntetőjog kapcsolata – az önálló bírósági végrehajtók tevékenysége során leggyakrabban előforduló büntetőjogi kategóriák, gyakorlati példák alapján

Gazdaságetika Társadalomtudományi Folyóirat 9. szám, 2022. Végrehajtás és szolidaritás a Katolikus Egyház együttműködésével

Jogelméleti Szemle 2022/2. szám, A Végrehajtó; régen és napjainkban, avagy az "arányos" végrehajtási eljárás